

1 **Minutes**

2 **South Carolina Real Estate Appraisers Board**

3 **Thursday, February 16, 2023, 10:00 a.m.**

4 **Via WebEx**

5

6 **Meeting Called to Order:**

7 Jake Knight, Chairman, called the meeting of the South Carolina Real Estate Appraisers Board to
8 order at 10:00 a.m. Other board members present for the meeting included: Chris Barzack, Chris
9 Donato, Mark Chapman and Mike Dodds.

10 Mr. Knight announced that public notice of this meeting was properly posted at the South
11 Carolina Real Estate Appraisers office, Synergy Business Park, Kingstree Building, and provided
12 to all requesting persons, organizations, and news media in compliance with Section 30-4-80 of
13 the South Carolina Freedom of Information Act.

14 Staff members participating during the meeting included Wick Stuart, Office of Advice Counsel;
15 Malcolm Burton, Office of Investigations; Erin Baldwin, Office of Disciplinary Counsel; James
16 Kemfort, Chief Investigator; Laura Smith, Administrator; and Cory Griffin, Administrative
17 Assistant.

18 The following members of the public were present: Scott DiBiasio, Appraisal Institute; Paul
19 Ryll, Oscar Mike Appraisal Group; Wes Hasty, SCPAC.

20

21 **Introduction of Board Members and All Other Persons Attending**

22 The board members, LLR staff and all others in attendance introduced themselves.

23

24 **Approval of Agenda**

25 **MOTION:**

26 Mr. Dodds made the motion to approve the amended agenda, removing the disciplinary hearing,
27 which settled prior to the meeting. Mr. Chapman seconded the motion, which carried
28 unanimously.

29

30

31 **Approval of the Minutes from Board Meeting**

32 **MOTION:**

33 Mr. Chapman made the motion to approve the minutes from the November 30, 2022 board
34 meeting. Mr. Dodds seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

35

36 **Chairman's Remarks**

37 Mr. Knight thanked all of the board members and public members for attending the meeting.

38

39 **Compliance Hearing**

40 Mr. Knight cleared the lobby for a private testimony from Case #2019-30 regarding
41 reinstatement of suspended license.

42 **MOTION:**

43 Mr. Chapman made the motion to go into executive session for legal advice. Mr. Donato
44 seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

45

46 **MOTION:**

47 Mr. Dodds made the motion to return from executive session. Mr. Chapman seconded the
48 motion, which carried unanimously.

49

50 **MOTION:**

51 Mr. Chapman made the motion for disposition of the case with the requirement for the licensee
52 to submit renewal application and paying appropriate fees. Licensee must meet all continuing
53 education criteria before submitting renewal application. License will remain on pending status
54 until required supervisor name is reported to staff, as required in the original board order. Mr.
55 Donato seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

56

57

58 **Approval of the Investigative Review Committee (IRC) Report- James Kemfort**

59 The IRC report dated February 2nd, 2023 presented for approval. Discussion ensued.

60 **DISMISSALS**

Case #	Investigator	Initial Complaint Allegations	IRC Logic
2022-30	Mac Burton	Respondent acted as an appraiser by preparing a written property valuation report for a tax appeal.	Dismissal – The Respondent was not practicing as an appraiser at a county tax re-assessment board meeting.
2022-39	Mac Burton	Report grid incorrectly identified basement as unfinished affecting report conclusions.	Dismissal – No Violation
2022-53	Mac Burton	Tax appeal support for value developed by unlicensed business/individuals	Dismissal – No Violation – Letter to be issued advising Respondent to avoid appearance of unlicensed practice.

61

62 **FORMAL COMPLAINTS**

Case #	Investigator	Initial Complaint Allegations	IRC Logic
2022-35	Mac Burton	Value dispute based on use of older sales (over 6 months) with no time adjustment in a rising market when comparable sales available less than 6 months.	Formal Complaint
2022-42	Mac Burton	Alleged errors in the report, possible incorrect measurements, and unsupported adjustments.	Formal Complaint

63

64 **LETTERS OF CAUTION**

Case #	Investigator	Initial Complaint Allegations	IRC Logic
2022-26	Mac Burton	Complaint based on these issues: failure to adjust comparable; Failure to report Comparable sales history; Inappropriate Sales selection due to Location Use of dissimilar comparable sales(s) due to site characteristics; Use of physically dissimilar comparable sales – Gross Living Area	Letter of Caution – Minor errors in report does not affect the conclusion or credibility of the report.
2022-70	Mac Burton	ASC Private Notices reflect Respondent was disciplined by another state for CE violation.	Letter of Caution – Resolution Guidelines

65

66

67 **MOTION:**

68 Mr. Donato made the motion to accept the IRC recommendations for formal complaints, letters
69 of caution and dismissals. Mr. Dodds seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

70

71 **OIE APPRAISERS BOARD CASE REPORT – James Kemfort**

72 **OIE Status Report as of February 2nd, 2023**

Total Complaints Received 1/1/2023-2/2/2023	11
Active Investigations (Average Age - 29)	4
Closed	0

73

74

75 **Office of Disciplinary Counsel (ODC) Update – Erin Baldwin**

76 **ODC Case Load Statistics as of February 14th, 2023**

Board	Open Cases	Pending Hearings & Agreements	Pending Closure	Closed	Appeals
Appraisers	1	0	0	3	0
			*Closed since last report: (11/28//22)	3	
			*Closed since 1/1/22	10	

77

78

79 **Administrators Remarks - Laura Smith**

80 **Licensure Update**

81

82 **SC REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD NUMBER OF CREDENTIALS**

83 **AS OF February 14th, 2023**

	ACTIVE	INACTIVE	ACTIVE IN RENEWAL	TOTAL
Apprentice	270	0	54	324
Licensed	141	12	19	172
Certified Residential	1029	46	92	1167
Certified General	1044	31	93	1168
Licensed Mass	50	0	7	57
Certified Residential Mass	70	3	9	82
Certified General Mass	27	2	6	35
Total	2631	94	280	3005

84

85 **AMC Active 143 AMC Inactive 15 AMC Lapsed 14**

86

87 **TEMPORARY PERMITS**

ISSUED IN 2022	ISSUED IN 2023
185	19

88

89 **Budget Update**

90 Mrs. Smith provided the Budget Report for the Appraisers Board Account (\$1,347,596.82) for
 91 review by the Board. The National Registry Account (\$82,422.08) was also presented to the
 92 Board for review. This account is allocated to pay the National Registry fees to the Appraisal
 93 Subcommittee. These numbers are ending balances as of December 31, 2022.

94

95 **Appraiser Conferences**

96 Mrs. Smith discussed the upcoming conferences for the 2023 year. SCPAC Conference will be
 97 held in Myrtle Beach on February 23-24, 2023.

98 **MOTION:**

99 Mr. Chapman made the motion for the board to approve two board members and two staff
 100 members to attend the SCPAC meeting. Mr. Donato seconded the motion, which carried
 101 unanimously.

102

103 The AARO Conference will be held in Savannah, GA on May 9-11, 2023.

104

105 **MOTION:**

106 Mr. Chapman made the motion for the board to approve the Administrator and two board
107 members, to include new board members, if appointed prior to the conference, along with the
108 new investigator and Chief Investigator to attend the AARO Conference in Savannah, with the
109 Appraisers Board paying expenses for up to five people. Further, approval for the Administrator,
110 Investigator and Chief Investigator to attend the USPAP Course for Regulators offered the
111 morning prior to the conference. Mr. Donato seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

112

113 **Unfinished Business**

114 **USPAP**

115 Mrs. Smith presented the USPAP manual for approval by the board for it to be placed in the
116 State Register. The 2020-2021 USPAP manual was extended to December 31, 2023 by the
117 Appraiser Standards Board, with the Appraisal Foundation.

118 **MOTION:**

119 Mr. Chapman made the motion to adopt the standards and amendments of the 2020-2021
120 USPAP, as promulgated by the Appraisal Foundation, to be extended to December 31, 2023. Mr.
121 Donato seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

122

123 **Legislative Update**

124 Mrs. Smith presented updates to the board and all in attendance of the status of the statute that
125 has been submitted for the legislative process.

126

127 **ASC Grants**

128 After reviewing the Appraisal Subcommittee (ASC) grant process, Mr. Stuart suggest for staff to
129 apply for ASC grants in specific to PAREA and education if possible.

130 **MOTION:**

131 Mr. Dodds made the motion that the board approve the administrator's ability to apply to ASC
132 related grants in an effort to help set up PAREA program and other education programs. Mr.
133 Donato seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

134

135 **Public Remarks –**

136 Mr. Scott DiBasio let the board know that there was a 15-minute video further describing the
137 PAREA program available for review from the Appraisal Institute.

138 Mr. Knight thanked Mr. Malcolm Burton for his service over the years as he heads into
139 retirement. Mr. Burton thanked the board as he wraps up his service.

140

141 **Adjournment**

142 Mr. Donato made the motion to adjourn. Mr. Dodds seconded, which carried unanimously.

143

144 The next Real Estate Appraisers board meeting is scheduled for May 18, 2023.